REPUBLIC OF KENYA IN THE HIGH COURT OF KENYA AT NAIROBI

(MILIMANI LAW COURTS) JUDICIAL REVIEW DIVISION

CIVIL APPLICATION NO. E060 OF 2021

IN THE MATTER OF LAW REFORM ACT SECTION 7&8 CHAPTER 26 LAWS OF KENYA

AND

IN THE MATTER OF ORDER 53 RULE 1 OF THE CIVIL PROCEDURE RULES AND

IN THE MATTER OF APPLICATION UNDER ARTICLE 1(3), 2(2), 3, 6(2),10, 11, 94,95,96, 163(3)(d)(I) & (3)174(1), 175,179(1)&(4), 183(1), 185(3) & 189(1), 200 201(d), 212,225,226(2),229 (7)&(8) AND 259 OF THE CONSTITUTION OF KENYA AND

IN THE MATTER OF CONTRAVENTION OF COUNTY GOVERNMENTS ACT AND

IN THE MATTER OF CONTRAVENTION OF THE PUBLIC FINANCE MANAGEMENT ACT 2012

AND

IN THE MATTER OF AN APPLICATION FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW BETWEEN

as as a first assist	
REPUBLIC	APPLICANT
VERSUS	
THE SENATE OF THE REPUBLIC OF KENYA	1ST RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MOMBASA	2 ND RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KWALE	3 RD RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KILIFI	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TANA RIVER	5 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF LAMU	6 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TAITA/TAVETA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF GARISSA	8 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF WAJIR	9 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MANDERA	10 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MARSABIT	11 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF ISIOLO	12 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MERU	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF THARAKA NITHI	14 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF EMBU	15 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KITUI	16 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MACHAKOS	17 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MAKUENI	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NYANDARUA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NYERI	20 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KIRINYAGA	21 ST RESPONDENT

SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MURANG'A	22 ND RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KIAMBU	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TURKANA	24 TH RESPONDENT
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF WEST POKOT	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF SAMBURU	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TRANS NZOIA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF UASIN GISHU	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF ELGEYO/MARAKY	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NANDI	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BARINGO	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF LAIKIPIA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NAKURU	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NAROK	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KAJIANDO	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KERICHO	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BOMET	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KAKAMEGA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF VIHIGA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BUNGOMA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BUSIA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF SIAYA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KISUMU	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF HOMA BAY	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MIGORI	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KISII	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NYAMIRA	
SPEAKER, COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NAIROBI	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MOMBASA	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KWALE	41. (1974-1974) 1. (1
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KILIFI	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TANA RIVER	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF LAMU	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TAITA/TAVETA	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF GARISSA	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF WAJIR	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MANDERA	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MARSABIT	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF ISIOLO	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MERU	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF THARAKA NITHI	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF EMBU	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KITUI.	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MACHAKOS	
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MAKUENI	

COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NYANDARUA	66 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NYERI	67TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KIRINYAGA	68 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MURANG'A	69TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KIAMBU	70TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TURKANA	71STRESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF WEST POKOT	72ND RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF SAMBURU	73RD RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF TRANS NZOIA	74 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF UASIN GISHU	75 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF ELGEYO/MARAKWET	76 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NANDI	77TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BARINGO	78 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF LAIKIPIA	79 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NAKURU	80 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NAROK	81ST RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KAJIANDO	82 ND RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KERICHO	83 RD RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BOMET	84 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KAKAMEGA	85 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF VIHIGA	86 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BUNGOMA	87TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF BUSIA	88 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF SIAYA	89 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KISUMU	90 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF HOMA BAY	91 ST RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF MIGORI	92 ND RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KISII	93 RD RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NYAMIRA	94 TH RESPONDENT
COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF NAIROBI	95 TH RESPONDENT
AND	
COUNCIL OF GOVERNORS15	T INTERESTED PARTY
ATTORNEY GENERAL2 ^{NI}	INTERESTED PARTY
EXPARTE:	
CHARLES ONGARO KIAGE	1ST APPLICANT
CPA BENSON ORINA BOSIRE	2 ND APPLICANT
RICHARD OSEKO OGETO	
WILLIAM ANDREW KINANGA OBAGA	4 TH APPLICANT
JARED MOMANYI	

NOTICE OF MOTION

[Section 1A,1B & 3A of the Civil Procedure Act, Order 53 rules 1 (1), (2) and (4) of the Civil Procedure Rules, the Law Reform Act Cap 26 and all other enabling provisions of law& leave granted on 7th May, 2021]

TAKE NOTICE that this Honourable Court will be moved on the......day of2021 at 9.00 O'clock in the forenoon or so soon thereafter by counsel for the Applicant FOR ORDERS THAT;

- 1. This honourable Court do make a declaration that the decision of the Senate of the Republic of Kenya by a Notice to appear, published in the Standard Newspaper on 23rd April 2021 to summon for questioning the Chief Executive Officers of the 47 County Government Executive on the Reports of the Auditor General on Financial Statements for the financial year 2018/2019 by the Senate County Public Accounts and Investment (CPA&I) Committee and is ultra vires its Constitutional mandate hence invalid, void and of no effect.
- 2. This honourable court do issue an order of Prohibition directed at the Senate of the Republic of Kenya Committee of the County Public Accounts and Investment(CPA&I) or full plenary from summoning for questioning the Chief Executive Officers of the 47 County Government Executive for consideration of Reports of the Auditor General on the Financial Statements for the financial year 2018/2019
- 3. This Honourable Court do issue an order of Mandamus directed to the Respective County Assemblies (the 49th to 95th Respondents) to debate and consider the Reports of the Auditor General on the Financial Statements and take appropriate action and recommendations as required by article 229(7) & (8) of the constitution of Kenya.
- 4. This honourable court be pleased to make a declaration that the Speakers of the respective County Assemblies (the 2nd to 48th Respondents) who have not periodically complied with the provisions of Article 229(8) of the constitution of

Kenya by ensuring that all the reports of the Auditor General on the Financial Statements are debated and recommendations made within the constitutional timelines are in breach of their constitutional and statutory duty and are therefore unfit to continue holding public office.

- 5. [Further or in the alternative] damages arising from the matters herein and interest thereon.
- 6. An order for costs.

<u>WHICH APPLICATION</u> is founded upon the following grounds and the annexed affidavit of the 1st Applicant CHARLES ONGARO KIAGE filed herein and on such further grounds to be adduced at the hearing hereof.

- (i) The Senate of the Republic of Kenya through the Clerk has by a notice published in the Standard Newspaper of 23rd April 2021 issued a Notice to Appear before the County Public Accounts and Investment (CPA&I) Committee of the Senate in the months of May, June, July, August and September directed to the Chief executive Officers of the 47 County Government Executive to appear before the said committee but does not have the requisite constitutional authority as envisaged in Article 2(2) and 226(2) of the Constitution.
- (ii) The Constitution has clearly defined the role of the Senate at Article 96 and the function of questioning or considering the Reports of the Auditor General on the financial statement of the county entities is not among them
- (iii) The constitution provides that the Chief Executive Officer to the County Government Executive/unit is expressly answerable to the County Assembly on issues financial resource management and therefore by dint of Article 6(2) and Article 189(1), that function needs to be exercised by the rightful authority.
- (iv) The persons sought to be questioned by the 1st Respondent are the Chief Executive Officers of the County Government Executive who are also the

- accounting officers and by virtue of Article 226(2) are accountable to the County Assemblies
- (v) The Report sought to be evaluated and or discussed is foreign to the senate as the same is prepared by the Auditor General and submitted to the County Assembly as per the provisions of Article 229(7) as read with Article 226(2) as contra-distinguished with Article 93 of the Constitution.
- (vi) The execution of the subject decision will contravene the express provisions of article 1(3), 2, 6, 10, 11, 94, 96, 174, 175, 179, 183, 185, 189(1), 190, 201 and 259 of the Constitution.
- (vii) The continued execution of the subject decision has led to wastage and or imprudent use of public resources whereby there is duplication of roles leading to loss of public funds by way of travel, accommodation to and from Nairobi for the Governor together with the Executive Committee and their handlers, and the Committee of the Senate in the event the Senate conducts the sittings at the County level. Wastage of time which could have otherwise used to serve the citizenry contrary to the provisions of Article 201(d) of the Constitution.
- (viii) The practice and conduct of the Senate has led to the Speakers of the various County Assemblies to abdicate their roles as mandated by the constitution which would have led to closer assessment and inquiry while serving the citizenry, development and enhancement of capacity to interrogate financial statements, budgets and audit reports in contravention of Article 73 of the constitution.
- (ix) There is a clear demonstration that the all the National Values and Principles as envisaged at Article 10 of the Constitution have not been applied by the Senate (the 1st Respondent) with regard to separation of powers and recognition of devolution.
- (x) Notwithstanding the erroneous acts of the various committees of the Senate in the past eight years there has been no recommendations to ride home

- about emanating therefrom hence the exercise can only be said to be a public embarrassment process, potential extortion and muscle flexing opportunities which is not a worth investment of public money.
- (xi) The law on separation of powers and functions is now well settled, and where there is express Authority, implied authority cannot override.
- (xii) The Senate has usurped the powers of the County Assembly and purports to take up a function of devolved units without undertaking a referendum under Article 225 and the speakers (the 2nd to 48th Respondents) have willingly allowed the same to happen.
- (xiii) This honourable Court is clothed with the requisite jurisdiction to hear and determine the issues herein.

(xiv) It is in the best interest of justice that the prayers sought are granted.

DATED at NAIROBI this 20 day of May 2021

Gekonde Omariba Advocate LSK/2021/2530 P.105/4394/01 OMARIBA & COMPANY ADVOCATES FOR THE APPLICANTS

DRAWN AND FILED BY

Omariba & Company Advocates, Tetu Housing Co-Operative Flats, Block D Suite D1, Ralph Bunche Road P.O. Box 2012-00100, Nairobi.

TO BE SERVED UPON: -

The Senate of the Republic of Kenya Parliament Nairobi.

Speakers of the 47 Counties (through their respective offices)

County Assembly of Mombasa

7 | Page

P.O BOX 90440-80100

Mombasa

Email:info@mombasaassembly.go.ke

Tel; +254 41 2311 025

Kwale County Assembly

P.O BOX 231-80403

Email; countyassemblyofkwale@gmail.com

Tel: 0721883464

County Assembly of Kilifi

P.O BoX 332-80200

Malindi

Phone Number: +254 20 217 122 0 Email: info@kilifiassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Tana River

P.O Box 113 -70101

Hola

Email: info@tanariverassembly.go.ke

Tel;

County Assembly of Lamu

P.O BOX 74-80500

Lamu

Email: info@lamu.go.ke

Tel; 0715 555111/0758005005

County Assembly of Taita/Taveta

P.O BoX 1142-80304

Wundayi

Phone Number: +254718703359 / 732604811

Email: informationdesk@taitatavetaassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Garissa

P.O BoX 57-70100

Garissa

Phone Number:

Email: clerk@garissaassembly.go.ke/ countyassembly@gmail.com

County Assembly of Wajir

P.O BoX 9-70200

Wajir

Phone Number: 0464421297

Email: assembly@wajirassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Mandera P.O BoX 13-70300

Wajir

Phone Number: +254 723-577-006 Email: info@manderaassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Marsabit

P.O Box 29-60500.

Marsabit

Phone Number:

Email:

County Assembly of Isiolo

P.O Box 195-60300

Isiolo.

Email: info@assembly.isiolo.go.ke

Phone Number: 0725624489

County Assembly of Meru

P.O. Box 3 60200,

Meru.

Email: assembly@meru.go.ke;

Phone: 064-30040/064-30042; Mobile: 0708 777 000

County Government of Tharaka Nithi

P.O BOX 684-60406,

Chuka

Email: clerk@tharakanithica.go.ke

Tel;

County Assembly of Embu

Embu.

Email: info@embuassembly.go.ke.

Mobile No. 0734 867 105. Landline . 068 02231208.

County Assembly of Kitui,

P.O BOX 694 - 90200,

Kitui, Kenya.

Email: kituiassembly@gmail.com

County Assembly of Machakos, Along Mwatu wa Ngoma Road, P.O. Box 1168 – 90100 Machakos.

Phone: 020 2100981

Email: info@machakosassembly.com

County Assembly of Makueni Assembly Buildings P.O. Box 572 - 90300 Wote, Makueni

Tel.: 020 2393005

Mobile: 0714392799, 0735660505, 0731663505

Email: info@makueniassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Nyandarua County Assembly Chambers, Ol'Kalou Office Tel: 0743079333 P.O. Box 720-20303- OL KALOU email:nyandaruacountyassembly@gmail.com info@nyandaruaassembly.go.ke clerk@nyandaruaassembly.go.ke

County Assembly Of Nyeri P O Box 162 - 10100, Nyeri Tel: +061 2037100

Email: Info@nyeriassembly.go.ke

County Assembly Of Kirinyaga Kiang'ombe Road, Kerugoya Tel;(020) 200 8563, (+254) 79 052 3397 Email: info@kirinyagaassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Murang'a P.O BOX 731-10200 Email info@assembly.muranga.go.ke Tel . 0719 802495

County Assembly of Kiambu Assembly Buildings, Kiambu County **Phone:**+254 (067) 586-0000 Email: <u>info@kiambuassembly.go.ke</u> <u>kiambucountyassembly@gmail.com</u>

County Assembly of Turkana, P.O. Box 25-30500, Lodwar, Kenya. Tel 0705 896983

Email: info@turkanaassembly.go.ke

West Pokot County Assembly. P.O. Box 6 – 30600. Kapenguria. Phone: 053-201-5000.

Email: info@westpokotassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Samburu, P.O. Box 3 - 20600 Maralal, Kenya. Phone: +254 065 62456, +254 65 62075. Email:info@samburuassembly.go.ke.

County Assembly of Trans Nzoia. P.O. Box 4211-30200, Kitale, kenya. Email: assembly@transnzoia.go.ke.

County Assembly of Uasin Gishu. P.O. Box 100 30100, Eldoret, kenya. Email: ugcountyassembly@gmail.com

County Assembly of Elgeyo Marakwet. P.O. Box 53 - 30700, Iten Town Email; info@emcassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Nandi P.O Box 802-30300 Kabsabet Email; info@nandiassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Baringo, P.O BOX 159-30400,

Kabarnet. Telephone:

E-mail: <u>info@baringoassembly.go.ke</u> <u>baringocountyassembly@gmail.com</u>

County Assembly of Laikipia P.O Box 487-10400 Nanyuki Phone Number 0740 031 031 Mail: info@laikipiaassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Nakuru P.O BOX, 907-20100 Email: info@assembly.nakuru.go.ke

County Assembly of Narok Mau Narok Road Narok,Kenya Assembly Info@narokassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Kajiado Email: info@kajiadoassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Kericho, P.o.Box 1526 - 20200, Kericho. Telephone: 0745169000 info@assembly.kericho.go.ke

County Assembly of Bomet P.O BOX 590-20400 Bomet, Kenya info@bometassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Kakamega P.O. Box 1470 – 50100 KAKAMEGA, KENYA. Tel; 0715-251211 EMAIL: <u>info@kakamega-assembly.go.kekamegacountyassembly@gmail.com</u>

TELEPHONE:

The County Assembly of Vihiga Majengo Town, Opp law Courts P. O. Box - 50300 +254 0720 375 045 info@vihigacountyassembly.or.ke

County Assembly of Bungoma, P.O Box 1886-50200 Phone Number: Email: info@bungomaassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Busia Tel: +254 723 174 098 Email: info@busiaassembly.go.ke Busia Liaison Office: +254 724 546 092

County Assembly of Siaya P.O BOX 7 - 40600, Siaya Mobile: . Email: siayaassembly.go.ke.

County Assembly of Kisumu Uhuru Road Opp. Haki House P.O. Box -40100, Kisumu.

E-mail: kisumuassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Homa-Bay P.O Box: 20-40300, Homa-Bay, Kenya. TEL; 0706511947 Email: homabayassembly.go.ke

County Assembly of Kisii P.O. Box 4550-40200 Kisii,Kenya +254 5820 30005/208 Email; info@kisiiassembly.go.ke County Assembly of Nyamira, P.O Box 590 - 40500, Nyamira. TEL:.

Email: info@nyamiraassembly.go.ke.

Nairobi City County Assembly P.O. Box: 45844 – 00100 Phone Number: (+254) 700 330846/7

(+254) 731 808078

Email: clerk@nairobiassembly.go.ke City Hall - Nairobi, City Hall Way

The Council of Governors Delta House Westlands Nairobi

The Attorney General Sheria House, 7th Floor Harambee Avenue, P.O. Box 40112-00100 Nairobi

NB; If any party served does not appear at the time and place fixed the court will proceed to hear and determine the application and any further orders your presence notwithstanding.